



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### Equity and NHS reforms What about independent sector treatment centres?

**Citation for published version:**

Pollock, AM, Godden, S & Kirkwood, G 2009, 'Equity and NHS reforms What about independent sector treatment centres?', *British Medical Journal (BMJ)*, vol. 339, b4255, pp. -. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.b4255>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.1136/bmj.b4255](https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.b4255)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

**Published In:**

British Medical Journal (BMJ)

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

BMJ 2009;339:b4255 This letter is published under a Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial licence (CC BY-NC 3.0).

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



## EQUITY AND NHS REFORMS

### What about independent sector treatment centres?

Cooper and colleagues have ignored the government's £5 billion independent sector treatment centre (ISTC) programme in explaining the narrowing of the gap in waiting times across social classes.<sup>1-3</sup> Patients attending such centres are routine and straightforward elective cases—that is, without complications and co-morbidities—and will have shorter waiting times. Compared with the rest of the NHS, ISTCs also treat fewer patients in lower socioeconomic groups.<sup>4</sup>

Lack of data and incomplete and poor quality data returns are hallmarks of the ISTC programme, in which cataract surgery, knee and hip replacement, and other treatments are delivered

to NHS patients by for-profit companies in mainly private facilities. Although all ISTCs are required to submit hospital episode statistics on all NHS patients treated, the Healthcare Commission found that during 2005-6 fewer than half of them returned any data.<sup>4</sup> Of the data returned, 43.4% were missing primary procedure codes and 7.6% had invalid primary procedure codes.<sup>5</sup> For 2006-7, 18.8% of episodes were missing primary procedure codes and 1.3% were invalid.<sup>5</sup>

Lack of data returns and incomplete data will seem to reduce the social class gradient in waiting times since ISTCs treat more patients from higher social classes with shorter waiting times. As a result, Cooper and colleagues cannot rule out data artefact as a critical explanation for the apparent improvements in equity.

**Allyson M Pollock** professor and director  
allyson.pollock@ed.ac.uk

**Sylvia Godden** senior research fellow

**Graham Kirkwood** research fellow, Centre for International Public Health Policy, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh EH8 9AG

**Competing interests:** None declared.

- 1 Cooper ZN, McGuire A, Jones S, Le Grand J. Equity, waiting times, and NHS reforms: retrospective study. *BMJ* 2009;339:b3264. (3 September.)
- 2 Pollock AM, Godden S. Independent sector treatment centres: evidence so far. *BMJ* 2008;336:421-4.
- 3 Pollock AM, Kirkwood G. Is the private sector better value for money than the NHS? A Scottish case study. *BMJ* 2009;338:b1421.
- 4 Healthcare Commission. Independent sector treatment centres. A review of the quality of care. 2007. [www.cqc.org.uk/\\_db/\\_documents/ISTC\\_Final\\_Tagged\\_200903243502.pdf](http://www.cqc.org.uk/_db/_documents/ISTC_Final_Tagged_200903243502.pdf)
- 5 Healthcare Commission. Independent sector treatment centres: the evidence so far. 2008. [www.cqc.org.uk/\\_db/\\_documents/Independent\\_sector\\_treatment\\_centres\\_The\\_evidence\\_so\\_far.pdf](http://www.cqc.org.uk/_db/_documents/Independent_sector_treatment_centres_The_evidence_so_far.pdf)

Cite this as: *BMJ* 2009;339:b4255